



EXECUTIVE SUMMARY
RFP No. RFP 23-224-TW
Annual Property Appraisal Services

RESPONSE DEADLINE: August 24, 2022 at 2:00 pm

Friday, December 9, 2022

SOLICITATION OVERVIEW

Project Title	Annual Property Appraisal Services
Project ID	RFP 23-224-TW
Project Type	Request For Proposal
Release Date	July 13, 2022
Due Date	August 24, 2022
Procurement Agent	Theodore White
Evaluators	Andi Christman, Patricia Green, Perry Peebles, Kevin Ratkus
Project Description	The County intends to maintain a list of approved appraisers who will be eligible to provide quotes on County appraisal projects. This list will be comprised of appraisers who possess the qualifications and experience necessary to perform appraisals which meet County standards. Any appraiser wishing to be added to this list should submit their qualifications to the County for review.

INTRODUCTION

Summary

Alachua County Board of County Commissioners is seeking proposals from licensed professionals (hereinafter, referred to as Consultants) for the provision of Annual Property Appraisal Services for the benefit of Public Works Department.

The following apply to this request for proposal: [Instruction to Proposers](#), [Terms and Conditions](#), [Insurance](#), [Scope of Work](#), [Sample Agreement/Contract](#), [Proposal Requirements and Organization](#), [Request for Proposal Selection Procedures](#), [Evaluation Phases](#), [Attachments](#), and [Submittals](#).

The County intends to maintain a list of approved appraisers who will be eligible to provide quotes on County appraisal projects. This list will be comprised of appraisers who possess the qualifications and experience necessary to perform appraisals which meet County standards. Any appraiser wishing to be added to this list should submit their qualifications to the County for review.

Background

Location: Alachua County is located in North Central Florida. The County government seat is situated in Gainesville. Gainesville is located 70 miles southwest of Jacksonville, 129 miles southeast of Tallahassee, 140 miles northeast of Tampa - St. Petersburg and 109 miles northwest of Orlando. Alachua County has a population of over 250,000 and a regional airport. The County itself consists of a total area of 969 square miles.

Form of Government: Alachua County is governed by a Board of five (5) elected County Commissioners and operates under the established County Manager Charter form of government. In addition to the five County Commissioners, there are five elected Constitutional Officers: Supervisor of Elections, Sheriff, Clerk of the Court, Tax Collector, and the Property Appraiser. The Alachua County Attorney also reports to the Board.

Contact Information

Theodore White

Procurement Agent II, CPPB

12 SE 1st St Gainesville

Gainesville, FL 32605

Email: twhite@alachuacounty.us

Phone: [\(352\) 384-3091](tel:(352)384-3091)

Department:

Public Works

Timeline

OpenGov Release Project Date	July 13, 2022
Question Submission Deadline	August 14, 2022, 12:00am
Solicitation Submission Deadline	August 24, 2022, 2:00pm

<p>Solicitation Opening – Zoom Meeting</p>	<p>August 24, 2022, 2:00pm The scheduled solicitation opening will occur via Zoom; the information to join is provided below. Attendance (live viewing) of the proposals opening is not required.</p> <p>Join Zoom Meeting https://zoom.us/j/93437702771?pwd=S2QxMVpUTG5xQUtBTEVMbkRxakNEZz09</p> <p>Meeting ID: 934 3770 2771 Passcode: 702897 One tap mobile +13126266799,,93437702771# US (Chicago) +19292056099,,93437702771# US (New York)</p> <p>Dial by your location +1 312 626 6799 US (Chicago) +1 929 205 6099 US (New York) +1 301 715 8592 US (Germantown) +1 346 248 7799 US (Houston) +1 669 900 6833 US (San Jose) +1 253 215 8782 US (Tacoma) Meeting ID: 934 3770 2771 Find your local number: https://zoom.us/u/adtsfJybhW</p> <p>If you have a disability and need an accommodation in order to participate in a County program, service or public meeting, please contact the Alachua County ADA Coordinator at ADA@alachuacounty.us or Equal Opportunity Office at 352-374-5275 at least 7 business days prior to the event. TDD/TTY users, please call 711 (Florida Relay Service)</p>
---	---

SOLICITATION STATUS HISTORY

Date	Changed To	Changed By
Jun 22, 2022 9:23 AM	Draft	Theodore White

Date	Changed To	Changed By
Jul 6, 2022 3:34 PM	Review	Theodore White
Jul 13, 2022 10:32 PM	Final	Theodore White
Jul 13, 2022 10:32 PM	Post Pending	Theodore White
Jul 13, 2022 11:00 PM	Open	OpenGov Bot
Aug 24, 2022 2:00 PM	Pending	OpenGov Bot
Sep 8, 2022 11:06 AM	Evaluation	Theodore White
Nov 16, 2022 3:04 PM	Award Pending	Theodore White

SELECTED VENDORS

VENDORS RECOMMENDED BY THE EVALUATION PROCESS

Vendor	Location
Clayton, Roper & Marshall, Inc.	Altamonte Springs, FL
Florida Property Consultants Group (aka Deighan Appraisal Associates, Inc.)	Tallahassee, FL
Pinel & Carpenter, Inc.	Maitland, FL
Santangini Appraisals, LLC	GAINESVILLE, FL
The Urban Group, Inc.	Ft. Lauderdale, FL

PROPOSALS RECEIVED

Status	Vendor	Contact Info	Submission Date
Submitted	Clayton, Roper & Marshall, Inc.	Craig Clayton accounting@crmre.com (407) 772-2200 Ext: 315	Aug 24, 2022 12:21 PM
Submitted	Florida Property Consultants Group (aka Deighan Appraisal Associates, Inc.)	Lynn Cochran lynn@fpc-group.com (850) 906-9997	Aug 24, 2022 12:09 PM
Submitted	Kroll, LLC	Brent Pitts brent.pitts@kroll.com (817) 614-4989	Aug 24, 2022 10:47 AM
No Bid	Network Craze	Michael Featherstone mfeatherstone@networkcraze.com	Jul 15, 2022 8:05 AM

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY
RFP No. RFP 23-224-TW
Annual Property Appraisal Services

Status	Vendor	Contact Info	Submission Date
Submitted	Pinel & Carpenter, Inc.	Walter Carpenter request@pinelcarpenter.com (407) 648-2199 Ext: 220	Aug 22, 2022 4:04 PM
Submitted	Santangini Appraisals, LLC	Laura Rutan laurarutan@gmail.com (352) 376-3351	Jul 30, 2022 5:42 PM
Submitted	The Urban Group, Inc.	Robert Miller rmiller@theurbangroup.com (954) 270-2680	Aug 23, 2022 12:39 PM
Submitted	Timberland Appraisal Services, LLC	Jeff Williams jeffwilliams@ellijay.com (706) 636-2908	Aug 8, 2022 1:25 PM
Disqualified	Zac Ryan Appraisal Services, Inc	Zac Ryan zac@forestenvironment.com	Aug 24, 2022 12:53 PM

VENDOR QUESTIONNAIRE PASS/FAIL

Question Title	Clayton, Roper & Marshall, Inc.	Florida Property Consultants Group (aka Deighan Appraisal Associates, Inc.)	Kroll, LLC	Network Craze	Pinel & Carpenter, Inc.
Corporate Resolution Granting Signature	Pass	Pass	Pass	No Response	Pass
Acknowledge that you have reviewed all Addendum(s) issued with this solicitation.	Pass	Pass	Pass	No Response	Pass
Public Record Trade Secret or Proprietary Confidential Business Information Exemption Request	Pass	Pass	Pass	No Response	Pass
Public Record Trade Secret or Proprietary Confidential Business Information Exemption Request	Pass	Pass	Pass	No Response	Pass
Public Record Trade Secret or Proprietary Confidential Business Information Exemption Request	No Response	No Response	No Response	No Response	No Response
SBE Option 1: SBE Proposer	Pass	Pass	Pass	No Response	Pass

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

RFP No. RFP 23-224-TW

Annual Property Appraisal Services

Question Title	Clayton, Roper & Marshall, Inc.	Florida Property Consultants Group (aka Deighan Appraisal Associates, Inc.)	Kroll, LLC	Network Craze	Pinel & Carpenter, Inc.
SBE Option 2: 30% SBE Proposer Participation	Pass	Pass	Pass	No Response	Pass
SBE Option 3: 15% - 29% SBE Prosper Participation	Pass	Pass	Pass	No Response	Pass
SBE Option 4: No Subcontractors	Pass	Pass	Pass	No Response	Pass
Option 5: Consultant SBE Good Faith Effort.	Pass	Pass	Pass	No Response	Pass
Alachua County Government Minimum Wage	Pass	Pass	Pass	No Response	Pass
Drug Free Workplace	Pass	Pass	Pass	No Response	Pass
State Compliance	Pass	Pass	Pass	No Response	Pass
Vendor Eligibility	Pass	Pass	Pass	No Response	Pass
NON-SBE Subcontractors	Pass	Pass	Pass	No Response	Pass
Responsible Agent Designation	Pass	Pass	Pass	No Response	Pass
Conflict of Interest	Pass	Pass	Pass	No Response	Pass
Request for Proposal Submittal Documentation		Pass	Pass	No Response	Pass
You have reviewed and completed all the required submittal requirements..		Pass	Pass	No Response	Pass

Question Title	Santangini Appraisals, LLC	The Urban Group, Inc.	Timberland Appraisal Services, LLC	Zac Ryan Appraisal Services, Inc (Excluded) (Disqualified)
Corporate Resolution Granting Signature	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
Acknowledge that you have reviewed all Addendum(s) issued with this solicitation.	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY
RFP No. RFP 23-224-TW
Annual Property Appraisal Services

Question Title	Santangini Appraisals, LLC	The Urban Group, Inc.	Timberland Appraisal Services, LLC	Zac Ryan Appraisal Services, Inc (Excluded) (Disqualified)
Public Record Trade Secret or Proprietary Confidential Business Information Exemption Request	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
Public Record Trade Secret or Proprietary Confidential Business Information Exemption Request	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
Public Record Trade Secret or Proprietary Confidential Business Information Exemption Request	Pass	Pass	No Response	No Response
SBE Option 1: SBE Proposer	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
SBE Option 2: 30% SBE Proposer Participation	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
SBE Option 3: 15% - 29% SBE Prosper Participation	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
SBE Option 4: No Subcontractors	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
Option 5: Consultant SBE Good Faith Effort.	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
Alachua County Government Minimum Wage	Pass	Pass	Fail	Fail
Drug Free Workplace	Pass	Pass	Fail	Pass
State Compliance	Pass	Pass	Fail	Pass
Vendor Eligibility	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
NON-SBE Subcontractors	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
Responsible Agent Designation	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
Conflict of Interest	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass

Question Title	Santangini Appraisals, LLC	The Urban Group, Inc.	Timberland Appraisal Services, LLC	Zac Ryan Appraisal Services, Inc (Excluded) (Disqualified)
Request for Proposal Submittal Documentation	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
You have reviewed and completed all the required submittal requirements..	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass

QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS

1. RFP pdf Document Item #7.5 Budget

Jul 28, 2022 12:34 PM

Question:

We are not clear on this item requesting budget for key positions. Can you please provide clarification as to what you mean by budget? Thank you.

Jul 28, 2022 12:06 PM

Answered by Theodore White:

In Project Documents, under Pricing Proposal we are asking for the hourly rate for key positions to be submitted with your Proposal. We will use these hourly rates as scoring criteria when the RFP review team evaluates and scores the Proposals.

Jul 28, 2022 12:33 PM

ADDENDA & NOTICES

ADDENDA ISSUED:

Addendum #1

Aug 8, 2022 1:51 PM

Alachua County is extending this RFP 2 weeks.

Please use the [See What Changed](#) link to view all the changes made by this addendum.

ADDENDA ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS:

Addendum #1

Proposal	Confirmed	Confirmed At	Confirmed By
Santangini Appraisals, LLC	X	Aug 8, 2022 1:56 PM	Laura Rutan

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY
RFP No. RFP 23-224-TW
Annual Property Appraisal Services

Timberland Appraisal Services, LLC	X	Aug 9, 2022 9:50 AM	Jeff Williams
Pinel & Carpenter, Inc.	X	Aug 8, 2022 5:02 PM	Walter Carpenter
The Urban Group, Inc.	X	Aug 23, 2022 12:11 PM	Robert Miller
Kroll, LLC	X	Aug 23, 2022 5:35 PM	Brent Pitts
Florida Property Consultants Group (aka Deighan Appraisal Associates, Inc.)	X	Aug 8, 2022 2:12 PM	Lynn Cochran
Clayton, Roper & Marshall, Inc.	X	Aug 24, 2022 11:57 AM	Craig Clayton

NOTICES ISSUED:

Notice #1

Sep 7, 2022 3:38 PM

Notice #2

Sep 8, 2022 4:51 PM

Alachua County Procurement announces a public meeting to which all persons are invited to attend an Evaluation Committee Meeting on Monday, September 26, 2022 @ 10:00 am, to evaluate and make final recommendations of the proposals for competitive solicitation for RFP 23-224-TW Annual Property Appraisal Services. The final recommendations will be sent to the Board of County Commissioners.

Topic: Public Notice of Evaluation Committee Meeting for RFP 23-224-TW Annual Property Appraisal Services

Time: Monday, September 26, 2022 @ 10:00 am Eastern Time (US and Canada)

Location: Public Works Department, Conference Room B, 5620 NW 120 Lane, Gainesville, FL

Join Virtual Zoom Meeting

<https://us02web.zoom.us/j/89482329815>

Meeting ID: 894 8232 9815

One tap mobile

+13017158592,,89482329815# US (Washington DC) 13092053325,,89482329815#

+US

Dial by your location

+1 301 715 8592 US (Washington DC)

+1 309 205 3325 US

+1 312 626 6799 US (Chicago)

+1 646 931 3860 US

+1 929 205 6099 US (New York)

+1 564 217 2000 US

+1 669 444 9171 US

+1 669 900 6833 US (San Jose)

+1 719 359 4580 US

+1 253 215 8782 US (Tacoma)

+1 346 248 7799 US (Houston)

+1 386 347 5053 US

Meeting ID: 894 8232 9815

Find your local number: <https://us02web.zoom.us/j/kcfH22e99S>

These meetings are subject to change and/or cancellation. If you have any questions regarding these meetings, please call 352.384.3090. All persons are advised that, if they decide to contest any decision made at any of these meetings, they will need a record of the proceedings and, for such purpose, they may need to ensure that verbatim record of the proceedings is made which record includes the testimony and evidence upon which the appeal is to be based. If any accommodations are needed for persons with disabilities, please contact the County's Equal Opportunity Office at (352)374-5275 or (TTD) (352)-374-5284.

Notice #3

Oct 3, 2022 9:52 AM

The final rankings be approved and then start contract negotiations the with the top 5 ranked firms.

1. Santangini Appraisals, LLC
2. Pinel & Carpenter, Inc.
3. Clayton, Roper & Marshall, Inc.
4. Florida Property Consultants Group (aka Deighan Appraisal Associates, Inc.)
5. The Urban Group, Inc.

The actual RFP award is subject to the appropriate signature authority identified in the Procurement Code.

EVALUATION

PHASE 1

EVALUATORS

Name	Title	Agreement Accepted On
Andi Christman	Program Manager	Sep 21, 2022 1:49 PM
Patricia Green	Right of Way Specialist	Sep 8, 2022 11:38 AM
Perry Peeples	Real Property Coordinator	Sep 8, 2022 11:18 AM
Kevin Ratkus	Senior Planner - Conservation Land Acquisition Coordinator	Sep 21, 2022 9:24 AM

EVALUATION CRITERIA

Criteria	Description	Scoring Method	Weight (Points)
----------	-------------	----------------	-----------------

Ability of Professional Personnel	<p>A. Resumes of the key staff support the firm's Competency in doing this type of work? Key staff includes the Project Manager, and other project team professionals.</p> <p>B. Has the firm done this type of work in the past?</p> <p>C. Is any of this work to be subcontracted? If so, what are the abilities of the firm(s) to be subcontracted?</p> <p>D. Based on questions above, award points as follows:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. 21-30 points - Exceptional Experience 2. 11-20 points - Average Experience 3. 0-10 points - Minimal Experience <p>E. Has the company or key staff recently done this type of work for the County, the State, or for local government in the past?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. If the work was acceptable, award up to 	Points Based	50 (25% of Total)
-----------------------------------	---	--------------	-------------------

Criteria	Description	Scoring Method	Weight (Points)
	<p>ten (10) points.</p> <p>2. If the firm has not done this type of work, award zero (0) points.</p> <p>3. If the work was unacceptable, deduct up to ten (10) points and note why.</p> <p>F. Are there factors, such as unique abilities, which would make a noticeable (positive) impact on the project?</p> <p>1. If the answer is yes, award from one (1) to ten (10) points and note reasons.</p> <p>2. If the answer is no, award zero (0) points.</p>		

Criteria	Description	Scoring Method	Weight (Points)
Capability to Meet Time and Budget Requirements	<p>A. Does the level of key staffing and their percentage of involvement, the use of subcontractors (if any), office location, and/or information contained in the transmittal letter indicate that the firm will, or will not, meet time and budget requirements?</p> <p>B. To your knowledge, has the firm met or had trouble meeting time and budget requirements on similar projects?</p> <p>C. Have proof of insurability and other measures of financial stability been provided?</p> <p>D. Are time schedules reasonable?</p> <p>E. Are position pricing reasonable?</p> <p>F. Current Workload.</p> <p>G. This factor is designed to determine how busy a firm is by comparing all Florida work against Florida personnel.</p>	Points Based	20 (10% of Total)

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY
RFP No. RFP 23-224-TW
Annual Property Appraisal Services

Criteria	Description	Scoring Method	Weight (Points)
Location	Points Provided by Procurement.	Points Based	10 (5% of Total)
Small Business Enterprise Participation (SBE)	Points Provided by Procurement.	Points Based	15 (7.5% of Total)
Volume of Previous Work (VOW) awarded by the County	Points Provided by Procurement.	Points Based	5 (2.5% of Total)
Written - Understanding of Project	<p>A. Did the proposal indicate a thorough understanding of the project?</p> <p>B. Is the appropriate emphasis placed on the various work tasks?</p>	Points Based	25 (12.5% of Total)
Written - Project Approach	<p>A. Did the firm develop a workable approach to the project?</p> <p>B. Does the proposal specifically address the County's needs or is it "generic" in content?</p>	Points Based	25 (12.5% of Total)
Written - Project Manager	<p>A. Does the project manager have experience with projects comparable in size and scope?</p> <p>B. Does the Project Manager have a stable job history? Has he/she been with the firm long, or have there been frequent job changes?</p>	Points Based	10 (5% of Total)

Criteria	Description	Scoring Method	Weight (Points)
Written - Project Team	<p>A. Was a project team identified?</p> <p>B. Is the team makeup appropriate for the project?</p> <p>C. Do the team members have experience with comparable projects?</p> <p>D. Are there any sub contracted firms involved? Will this enhance the project team?</p> <p>E. Are the hours assigned to the various team members for each task appropriate?</p>	Points Based	20 (10% of Total)
Written - Project Schedule	<p>A. Is the proposed schedule reasonable based on quantity of personnel assigned to the project?</p> <p>B. Are individual tasks staged properly and in proper sequence?</p>	Points Based	10 (5% of Total)

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY
RFP No. RFP 23-224-TW
Annual Property Appraisal Services

Criteria	Description	Scoring Method	Weight (Points)
Written - Proposal Organization	<p>A. Was proposal organization per the RFP?</p> <p>B. Was all required paperwork submitted and completed appropriately?</p> <p>C. Did the proposal contain an excessive amount of generic boilerplate, resumes, pages per resume, photographs, etc.?</p>	Points Based	10 (5% of Total)

AGGREGATE SCORES SUMMARY

Vendor	Andi Christman	Patricia Green	Perry Peeples	Kevin Ratkus	Total Score (Max Score 200)
Clayton, Roper & Marshall, Inc.	163	163	130	141	149.25
Florida Property Consultants Group (aka Deighan Appraisal Associates, Inc.)	131	168	153	125	144.25
Kroll, LLC	107	146	140	95	122
Pinel & Carpenter, Inc.	165	173	158	151	161.75
Santangini Appraisals, LLC	183	197	172	156	177
The Urban Group, Inc.	123	162	140	88	128.25
Timberland Appraisal Services, LLC	112	99	160	128	124.75

VENDOR SCORES BY EVALUATION CRITERIA

Vendor	<u>Ability of Professional Personnel</u> Points Based 50 Points (25%)	<u>Capability to Meet Time and Budget Requirements</u> Points Based 20 Points (10%)	<u>Location</u> Points Based 10 Points (5%)	<u>Small Business Enterprise Participation (SBE)</u> Points Based 15 Points (7.5%)	<u>Volume of Previous Work (VOW) awarded by the County</u> Points Based 5 Points (2.5%)
Clayton, Roper & Marshall, Inc.	41.8	18.8	0	0	5

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

RFP No. RFP 23-224-TW

Annual Property Appraisal Services

Vendor	Ability of Professional Personnel Points Based 50 Points (25%)	Capability to Meet Time and Budget Requirements Points Based 20 Points (10%)	Location Points Based 10 Points (5%)	Small Business Enterprise Participation (SBE) Points Based 15 Points (7.5%)	Volume of Previous Work (VOW) awarded by the County Points Based 5 Points (2.5%)
Florida Property Consultants Group (aka Deighan Appraisal Associates, Inc.)	39.8	18.3	0	0	3
Kroll, LLC	33	15.8	0	0	5
Pinel & Carpenter, Inc.	47.3	19	0	0	3
Santangini Appraisals, LLC	48.8	19.3	10	15	2
The Urban Group, Inc.	36.3	13	0	0	5
Timberland Appraisal Services, LLC	37.5	15	0	0	5

Vendor	Written - Understanding of Project Points Based 25 Points (12.5%)	Written - Project Approach Points Based 25 Points (12.5%)	Written - Project Manager Points Based 10 Points (5%)	Written - Project Team Points Based 20 Points (10%)	Written - Project Schedule Points Based 10 Points (5%)
Clayton, Roper & Marshall, Inc.	22	19.5	9.5	16.5	7.3
Florida Property Consultants Group (aka Deighan Appraisal Associates, Inc.)	21.5	21.3	8.3	16.3	6.5
Kroll, LLC	17.3	16	7.5	13.5	6
Pinel & Carpenter, Inc.	22.3	24	9.8	19.3	7.5
Santangini Appraisals, LLC	20.5	21	10	16	6.3
The Urban Group, Inc.	18	17.3	9.3	17.8	4.3
Timberland Appraisal Services, LLC	18	17.3	7.5	13.5	5.8

Vendor	Written - Proposal Organization Points Based 10 Points (5%)	Total Score (Max Score 200)
Clayton, Roper & Marshall, Inc.	9	149.25
Florida Property Consultants Group (aka Deighan Appraisal Associates, Inc.)	9.5	144.25
Kroll, LLC	8	122

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY
RFP No. RFP 23-224-TW
Annual Property Appraisal Services

Vendor	<u>Written - Proposal Organization</u> Points Based 10 Points (5%)	Total Score (Max Score 200)
Pinel & Carpenter, Inc.	9.8	161.75
Santangini Appraisals, LLC	8.3	177
The Urban Group, Inc.	7.5	128.25
Timberland Appraisal Services, LLC	5.3	124.75